

Jurnal Ilmu Sosial
Mamangan
Program Studi Pendidikan Sosiologi STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat

Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Mamangan
Volume 9 , Issue 1 , January-June 2020

TITLE OF ARTICLE

Author (s) : Erna Ermawati Chotim
Source : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Mamangan, Volume 9 , Issue 1 , January-June 2020
Publisher : Laboratorium Pendidikan Sosiologi, STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat

To Cite This Article:

Chotim, Erna Ermawati. 2019. *Subsistence Economy and The Papua Women Trader Marginalization in The Indonesia-Papua New Guinea Border Trade Region* . Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Mamangan, Volume 9 , Issue 1 , January-June 2020: 26- 38.

Copyright © 2020, Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Mamangan
ISSN: 2301-8496 (*Print*) & 2503-1570 (*Online*)

Laboratorium Pendidikan Sosiologi
STKIP PGRI Sumatera Barat



Subsistence Economy and the Papuan Women Trader Marginalization in the Indonesia-Papua New Guinea Border Trade Region

Erna Ermawati Chotim

Universitas Nasional

Email: erna.chotim@civitas.unas.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This research was conducted in the context of indigenous Papuans empowerment program, specifically focused on Papuan women traders in the border region Muara Tami District, Papua. This region represents one of Indonesia's borders providing an economic surplus for the state. It has triggered the important question, that is to what extent the economic surplus in the border region has brought benefits to indigenous Papuans, particularly to their women traders? What are the direct benefits that Papuan women traders specifically get from economic surpluses from border trades? To determine the research areas, this research examines statistical data related to border trades that has made the Papua-PNG border an area with an economic surplus. This research collected data by using qualitative methods which include in-depth observations and interviews with economic actors involved in border trades equipped with the documentation study of the regional and national level-statistical data. Source and method triangulation were used for data validity. The study's result illustrates that women Papuan traders face a greatly complex issue. The reality is that amidst the said surplus, the Papuan women traders are still dealing with the subsistence economy and being marginalized from productive economic sources which have implications for the emergence of the dimensions and types of marginalization. In other words, as the indigenous traders, these women have not become direct beneficiaries of the economic surplus. Sociocultural system and policy intervention lacking understanding of women's issues are the factors which contribute to the subsistence economy and marginalization. Without a positive discrimination policy, affirmative action, and social inclusion policy, it will be hard for these indigenous Papuan women traders to actively participate in the economic development process and to serve as direct beneficiaries of the current and future economic surpluses in the border region.

Keywords: Papuan woman trader, economy Subsistence, Marginalization, Indigenous Papuan (OAP), Border trade, Social inclusion.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is an archipelago bordering several countries both on land and sea. Indonesia directly borders on land with Malaysia, Papua New Guinea (PNG), and Timor Leste. These boundaries are spread across Kalimantan, Papua and East Nusa Tenggara (NTT) islands, with their various border regions characteristics.

In general, the border regions in Indonesia are at a paradoxical position. On the one hand, border regions have enormous natural resource wealth and capacity (Daturatte, Jinca, & Wunas, 2010; Meagher, 2013; Timisela, 2015). But on the other hand, these regions are still underdeveloped compared to other regions in Indonesia as indicated by the educational, health and low economic conditions. Thus, a special concern for them is needed. BPS (Central Bureau of Statistics) data notes that Papua Province is still the region with the highest poverty rate in Indonesia. BPS data in March 2019 shows the poverty rate reaches 27.53%. The figure increased by 0.1% from the previous one in September 2018, with a poverty rate of 27.43%. In comparison, the national poverty rate was recorded only at 9.47% (BPS: 2019). This condition could be more alarming along with horizontal and vertical conflict situations that still often emerge in the dynamics of cross-border relations between states.

The underdevelopment aforementioned has encouraged the government to formulate policies and strategies for accelerating border region development. Through the formulations and policy, the border region is expected to catch up with the surrounding regions and work in synergy with the growth and development of the border regions of neighbouring countries. These policies and strategies are believed to protect or secure border regions from any attempts of the community or neighbouring countries to exploit natural resources so that economic activities in the border regions can run more selectively and optimally (Ikhwannuddin; Bappenas.go.id).

The government policies and strategies for accelerating border region development have provided many changes, including the construction of structures and infrastructures for the open interconnectivity among border regions that contribute to economic growth and trade in the region (Daturatte, SR, Jinca, MY, & Wunas, S. (2010). During the 4 (four) years,

the Jokowi's government through the Ministry of Public Works and Public Housing (PUPR) has completed the construction of supporting facilities at the Skouw Integrated State Border Post (PLBN) in Muara Tami District, Jayapura City, Papua. This program has managed to construct the road Trans-Papua as long as 3,103 km and 156 km left to be done, while in West Papua, the road along the 1,071 km have been built. This is quite fantastic given the previous governments had never done a road-building program for that significant length. Of course, this development has an impact on the interregional population mobility that at the end is expected to affect the economic growth acceleration in the border regions of Papua (Ministry of Public Works and Public Housing).

Among the Indonesian borders, the border region between Indonesia and Papua New Guinea (PNG) is an interesting one to study since the small-scale border trades of the area (RI-PNG) have an important role in socio-economic development, generally in Jayapura City and specifically in the Muara Tami District. The border trades in this area illustrates the economic surplus situation as indicated by the Goods Export Notification (PEB) data. The notification is made for goods passing through the Cross-border Post in Muara Tami District which mostly are consumer goods such as food products, ready-to-drink beverages, clothing, electronic equipment, automotive equipment and other home supplies traded in PNG border regions and supplied from Indonesia.

According to Titeca (Awang, Sulehan, Abu Bakar, Abdullah, & Liu, 2013), border trades are highly variable in terms of economic actors. They include a very well developed formal trade and become one of the forms of economic empowerment of the local community. Other than formal trade, there are also many informal trades in the Muara Tami District region as well as those that involve indigenous/local communities or traders coming from other regions. The above-mentioned gives us a picture about the borderland characteristic and its position as the strategic area and front line (front area) of a sovereign country, serving as a zone of contact both socially and economically among neighbouring citizens (Leadem ; 2013). In addition to its strategic position, the border region also has complex problems related to the

dynamics of relations between its economic actors consisting of formal, informal, subsistence, capitalist traders. These economic actors live side by side with one another and compete as well, in which the Papuan women traders involved must develop their adaptation strategies and flexibility to the existing situation to survive (Mee, W: 2014).

Given the important role of border trades in the economic growth of local communities, the researcher argues it is important to examine specifically the impact of trade activities on the local community in the Indonesia's border regions, particularly in the Muara Tami District. It seems that trade activities in this region have different characteristics and dynamics from other trade area activities, for example, the Indonesia-Malaysia border regions where Indonesian trade activities relatively lag behind that of Malaysia. However, in the Muara Tami district, trades are highly dynamic and provide a large economic surplus for the local community. Along with the border trade growth in the region, Muara Tami has also led us to an interesting clue on social-economic inequality among groups of migrants such as the Javanese, Bugis, and Makassarese. These ethnicities started to come in groups to the area through the transmigration program in the mid-1980s. They then co-exist with indigenous Papuan who have long settled in the area.

The transmigration program (in the 1980s) with all its dynamics contributed to the Muara Tami District development into residential and border regions neighbouring the PNG. The region and its economy have quite rapidly grown in a relatively short time. In comparison, in the 1970s, forests and shrubs covered most areas. Only within a decade, Muara Tami later developed into a new residential area of the Jayapura City.

As there was a transmigration program in the region, the Indonesian Government spent the US \$ 66 million on regional development, including the road and bridge infrastructure constructions, the establishment of trade centres, health facilities, education and security--by building border security posts.

Geographically, Muara Tami is the most extensive district in Jayapura City (626.7 km²) with the lowest population density (19 people per kilometre) at the same time. The total population is only around 11,869 people or 4.35% of the total population of Jayapura City

Since the Ministry of Trade opened the border in 1999 and launched the Skouw-Wutung pilot market development initiative for the RI-PNG border region, the ministry recorded a turnover of economic activity in the market reaching approximately Rp. 64,678,410,000. It then increased significantly in 2015 to approximately Rp. 96,000,000,000. This figure is even far exceeded the said total export trade from Jayapura Region to PNG of around USD 27,762.87 in the 2013 official record (Statistics, 2018).

These figures give us an interesting picture of the economic benefits gained from border trades, - which until this research took place - have been unrecorded (unrecorded trade) as part of the Indonesian government's formal trade transactions. Basic commodities such as rice, cooking oil, packaged food, household appliances, and electronic devices flowed from Indonesia to PNG in a traditional manner - following the habits of residents in two countries while they cross the border to visit each other -.

This research focuses on the development process in Papua, specifically on women Papuan traders in the context of development and economic growth in the Muara Tami District. The main question is to what extent the economic growth from border trades has benefited indigenous Papuans. Are indigenous Papuans able to participate in rapid progress or economic growth achieved? More specifically, by considering gender perspectives in Papuans indigenous economic activities, to what extent do Papuan women become direct beneficiaries of economic progress achieved in the border region?

Theoretical framework

A concept or theory in social research is an instrument or tool used to monitor and analyze the observed social reality. Concepts or theories should ideally be able to give meaning to the data or field information in social, cultural, economic, political and other contexts and try to relate them to more macro situations.

Studies on women in a community remain interesting in the context of development, industrialization, globalization and the technology 4.0 advancement today. Why is that? Because many developments happened often have direct or indirect implications for women. The implications are very varied according to the different social,

cultural, economic, political dimensions of each community. With this reality, it is difficult or even impossible for us to generalize the implications of the changes that occur to women. To understand this, we need an in-depth exploration of women's activities and relate them to the social, cultural, economic, political and other important dimensions existing at the community or regional level. This way we will understand the position of women amidst the changes occurring .

Previous studies or literature portrayed Papua as Stone Age and various processes to encourage a more civilized, modern society through various interventions to the changes (Martin Slama and Jenny Munro et al. (2015). It was a different situation when I conduct this research in the said border region. The population settlement and its various economic activities have much developed. We can see Indigenous Papuans including their women were involved in various economic interactions with migrants from many ethnic, economic and social backgrounds.

It is almost a common sight in Papua, where women do their daily activities at home, in the garden and at the same time they take some from their garden to sell at the market to meet their family needs. This reality shows that there is nothing new with a dual role in Papua, as it also exists in other rural and poor areas in Indonesia. For women in this category, having dual role is part of the nature of women they must live, because, without their role, their husbands and even their families will not be able to fulfil their daily needs. They experience poverty, but it does not make them surrender the survival of their families to their husbands. The problem is how the Papuan women traders can earn that worth their effort and acquire the same treatment and access as other economic actors do, and become direct beneficiaries of various developments and economic growth achieved at the regional level.

The Papuan women dual role-domestic duties and trade as their public sector activity- is a big improvement over the previous conditions. But the employment opportunity must be placed in the context of economic opportunities and other structural relations. How is the reciprocal relation of the Papuan women traders with their domestic and public activities? What constraints do they face that limit their access to the capacity building and

direct benefits from development and border economic growth?

Subsistence Economy and the Women Marginalization

Subsistence economy is a concept developed by James Scott in his book *The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia*. The book was published by Yale University Press in New Haven in 1976. Scott developed this concept based on his focus on the onslaught of global capitalism and colonial state on rural communities in Southeast Asia, including Indonesia. His major premise is that to deal with unexpected violence, which is mostly uncontrolled due to natural disasters or any human-caused disaster, the traditional rural community is obsessed with survival issues. The rural communities are strongly attached to their land and they depend on personalized protection (landlords, master, patron), resist against imported technical innovations, and are suspicious of the state. These are characteristics that this community often shows. All such attitudes and values reflect the need of rural communities to always minimize the coming risk that can lead this community into difficult phases in their lives. Scott's study explains that the moral challenge for the peasants when facing difficult situations is for seeking opportunities to survive and not for progress, profit-seeking, or profits (Anderson R., Benedict: 2011).

Apart from many criticisms on the study he did, James Scott was able to describe how the relation among peasant groups (micro relation), the relation between the peasants and the onslaught of early capitalism (macro relation) and their strategies to survive with the subsistence economy mechanism. This concept is still very relevant to be used to interpret the way the marginal groups in the agricultural community can survive with various obstacles and threats, including their female counterparts. In the context of this study, capitalism manifests itself in border trade with various products sold in the border regions by various traders coming from different ethnic and capacity backgrounds.

The subsequent studies have used the peasants' moral concepts and subsistence economy to analyze marginal groups, including the women. It is a relevant concept to illustrate how women deal with migrant

economic actors, patriarchal culture dominating their environment and with any program generated by government policies that tend to not fully understand women's positions and issues.

Another important and relevant concept regarding women Papuan traders is marginalization. In general, marginalization is defined as a process of exclusion. This concept is very useful to see the condition of women in the development process. A critical analysis on the concept of marginalization has come from Alison Scott, a British sociologist who contributed to several forms of marginalization which consist of:

- 1) The process of exclusion. What is meant here by this term is that women are excluded from wage labour or from certain types of wage labour.
- 2) The process of shifting women to the margins of the labour market. It means that women have a tendency to work in types of work that threaten their sustainable living; that pay them low wages or that seen as work with no required skills.
- 3) The process of feminisation or segregation. What is meant here by this term is that women workers are concentrated into certain types of work. In other words, types of work with such characteristics can be said to have been feminized (carried out solely by women). While segregation here means the separation of work based on gender (women and men).

The process of increasing economic inequality. In this case, it usually refers to a situation that shows wage inequality or other working conditions for the work done by men and women (Saptari; 2016).

In explaining the concept of marginalization, Scott likes to compare works done by men and women. But later, this concept of marginalization became relevant to be used to compare groups that have different backgrounds, regions and treatments so as to produce different positions and conditions. In his explanation, Scott emphasised that it is dangerous to make a universal generalisation without making such comparisons. In developing the concept of marginalization, although Scott tends to describe and analyze

certain social situations or realities, she does not explain why marginalization occurs.

Furthermore, Scott explained that we must adjust each description and analysis of the concept of marginalization to the dynamic situations by paying attention to the processual nature of a phenomenon. Here she has tried to explain that marginalization must be seen based on the passage of time from a certain reality or social phenomenon. Relativity must also be seen in that context. That is, we have to compare the forms of marginalization that women experience with those of men. It is necessary to compare the marginalization of one group with another group. These concepts are tools that the researcher uses to interpret data and field information obtained in this study. Of course, several other analytical tools are also used to help provide meaning and deeper analysis related to the situation the women traders in Papua have experienced.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study is part of a research on border trade acceleration conducted at the end of 2017 in several border regions, including the Jayapura Municipality, particularly in Muara Tami District which is a district that directly borders with Papua New Guinea. At the initial stage, by examining statistical data, the researcher put the border regions into two categories, namely the surplus and deficit border regions, based on, one of them, data of trade income from local and central governments. Based on the review, Papua-PNG border trade is included as a surplus border region. Therefore, the researcher intends to explore to what extent the dynamics and economic growth of the border trade achieved are distributed among indigenous Papuans, particularly among women Papuan traders.

This study uses observation and in-depth interviews with economic actors involved in border trade activities as its data collection techniques. The researcher observed border trade activities and all its dynamics of interaction among traders, particularly among women traders. This research focuses on women traders seen from a gender perspective.

For such interest, this study conducted data mining through in-depth interviews with traders, including indigenous Papuan traders, Papuan women traders, migrant traders, market managers, and consumers. The information

collected includes the historical aspects of border trade, social and economic interrelations among traders, the trade dynamics based on the context of the Papuan society and the perception of the trade actors towards the local and central government's policies. Qualitative methods are considered the most relevant, given the study of subsistence economy and marginalization emphasizes on the processual and relativity that will be difficult to explore by quantitative methods. Other data collection techniques have included the study of documentation of statistical data both from local governments and Indonesian Central Bureau of Statistics (*BPS*).

This research uses the source and method triangulation for data validation. With source triangulation, the researcher confirmed data from one informant (source) to another one (source) until the information obtained is complete and verified. The researcher also uses another triangulation in this study, namely a method triangulation that includes methods of observation, in-depth interviews and FGD (focus group discussion). By conducting two types of triangulation, we will have complete information or data.

As with qualitative research in general, in analyzing data, the researcher carries out the processes of data collection and field data analysis simultaneously. The information collected from observations is categorized for clarification and verified within in-depth interviews and FGDs. The process is carried out repeatedly in order to generate a complete and valid data category as a database used for the reporting and dissemination materials in several forms, including this journal article.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Indigenous Papuans' Subsistence Economy and Trade Activities

The lives of indigenous Papuans or *Orang Asli Papua* (abbreviated as *OAP*) in Muara Tami District have indicated an underdeveloped condition compared to that of the other population groups. Historically, the development of the Muara Tami District region with its various development programs has been the influencing factor for such conditions. In the mid-1980s, through the transmigration program, the Indonesian government had brought residents from Java and Sulawesi to settle in the region and provided them with agricultural land and plantations as incentives for transmigrants.

The program provided opportunities for transmigrants to become important economic actors in the agriculture, livestock and trade sectors of the region. At the same time, the indigenous Papuans were mostly still relying on limited economic activity. They used to farm and fish solely to make ends meet. When they have some to sell in the market, it was even a small amount. They used their earnings from sales to buy food that they did not produce themselves such as rice, salt, oil, etc.

A literature search, as well as a field interview, reveal that within two decades, the amount of indigenous Papuans living in the region has been decreasing. The wave of migrants gradually shifted their existence. The migrants have built settlements along with the supporting infrastructure and slowly shifted the settlements of indigenous Papuans to the periphery. The comparison of the total population found within this research is 70% of the migrant groups and 30% of indigenous Papuans. Although there are indigenous Papuans still inhabiting East and West Koya, they are only in a small amount and most of them are likely to concentrate their population in more remote villages within the district.

This reality has an impact on the welfare gap between indigenous Papuans and transmigrants regarding district area development. Unfortunately, we cannot capture the above reality from the available statistical data. Statistical data only gives a category or grouping of migrants and indigenous people in one census unit so that it has ignored a significant gap in the living conditions of the community between migrants and indigenous Papuans. We can capture the sharpest and most relevant realities qualitatively through direct observation and interviews so that we can explore the processual and relativity of each existing social phenomenon.

Regarding livelihoods, 73% of indigenous Papuans are farmers and fishermen and only 4.2% are recorded actively engaged in trade activities. Local residents grow vegetables, sweet potatoes, cassava, tomatoes, peppercorns, tamarind oranges, and other types of vegetables. This community uses a simple farming system and technique, and simple manual equipment as well. They produce agricultural products mainly for their own consumption and sell the small amount at the nearest local market which is Koya Market in the Muara Tami District.

Other agricultural products that have economic value for indigenous Papuans are forest products, including wood, rattan and sago. Sago is a forest product that they process for sago flour, while they use the leaves to make roofs. Some people use woods to make houses and some others sell them in blocks and boards. Rattan is one of the forest products that local people can take and use for making chairs and grain retaining walls for houses.

Regarding household economic activities, we have a noteworthy picture of trade activities mostly carried out by Papuan women. This has to do with local socio-cultural systems that place women in fully-burdened positions along with the complexity of their issues. Similarly, Maria Ruwastuti conveyed that the most fundamental, deeply ingrained, and real women issue lies in how and by whom women's gender roles and social positions are determined. In this context, it is the socio-cultural system of Papua that has put women in charge of having duties and obligations that give them all the great burdens and complex issues. The Papuan customary system still applies a strict division of labour between men and women. Papuan men have a role to maintain the 'security' of the family. They actualized the role among others by carrying out their obligations to create and maintain the fence of the house which is associated with family, customary and tribal security. Outside these activities, in general, men will get along or interact socially in public spaces such as at the roadsides, markets, local airports, and others. The activity is a place for men to obtain and exchange various information at the community and regional levels.

While women are placed as the main actors who run family functions. The women's wide range of activities includes farming, taking care of farm animals, caring for and looking after children and their family members, and also selling their garden products at small stalls at the market. They trade to meet the needs of the 'economy cash' serving as a medium of exchange for meeting their needs of goods that they cannot produce themselves. All described above mentioned are labelled as traditional Papuan women's positions and duties in the houses of both family and extended family.

Another important role of Papuan women is their reproductive role. A woman is an important icon or symbol that keeps the family going. Women are expected to give birth to many children who will look after maintaining family and customary assets as well

as the custom and ethnicity sustainability as a whole. A woman must continue to carry out all these functions even if she is pregnant. There is no way to 'shift' the role and function of their duties even during the pregnancy. The possible way they can do is to transfer some of their responsibilities to their daughter.

In many cases, after they work hard full-time, women often still have to deal with a number of problems in the family, for example, their high workload for maintaining and managing family assets, including land and dowry payments to the wife's parents (both directly or indirectly). So big their role and responsibility are so that their existence is vital and absolute for the family to the survival of a family. How women exist are customarily described as synonymous with "a safe, bright and peaceful home". Low education and lack of awareness for change have led them to endless works that they must bear and that gives no direct change to their lives.

The research of the border trades acceleration has pictured about the complexity of issues faced by women, particularly those of indigenous Papuan traders. I got a very different impression when observing firsthand that indigenous Papuan women traders have a different condition from what migrant women or migrant traders in general have. The commodities the indigenous Papuan women sell are limited to agricultural products harvested from their fields such as cassava, areca nuts, peanuts and a few local vegetables. The trade quantity or scale is also very limited. They sell one commodity in the amount of 1-3 kg only. In general, they take out the commodities of their own fields and take miles to bring the commodities to the local market. They use the sale proceeds to purchase various daily needs that they cannot produce by themselves such as cooking oil, rice, and so on. This is a real picture showing that their lives are similar to the poor farmers' as James Scott has generally explained. Papuan women traders carry out their economic activities solely to fulfil the daily needs and their families without the motive for seeking or collecting profits.

This is contrary to the characteristic of migrant traders who provide various basic needs. The migrant traders generally have large stalls which sell varied types of goods in a large amount and with an attractive display or packaging. This difference has made buyers fulfil their needs from the migrant traders' stalls. According to the field observation, indigenous

Papuan women traders have to wait until noon, even before evening, waiting for their goods being sold out. Often they are forced to sell their goods at low prices to obtain cash for buying the daily needs of her family. Or, they do barter with the others for the goods they need.

Another issue regarding the indigenous Papuan women traders is that they lack trade knowledge and skills. They simply take out their harvests and immediately bring and sell them in the market. They only have few or limited types of goods to sell. Based on the interviews, Papuan women traders had almost never changed their commodity variants over long periods of time. This fact justified what James C. Scott calls a subsistence economy, that is, an economy whose orientation is not for achieving maximum profits, but merely earning a minimum income that can sustain people to overcome their hunger. Furthermore, we can describe that the desire for subsistence securities is more dominant within Papuan women traders, that is an effort made to cover up their fear of scarcity or unfulfilled subsistence needs (Gajah Mada University Library, 2003; Scott, 1983; Triyono & Wijayanti, 2017)

Besides, Papuan women traders face another main issue, that is their lack of access to capital. This is indeed not a new and typical issue for Papua. The issue of access to capital is a main obstacle faced by women in most parts of Asia. Women have no access to loan facilities for running their productive activities (Wellalage & Locke, 2017). Not only about the access, but women also often experience discrimination in obtaining loan facilities for the businesses they run. This issue is in line with the findings of other studies (Rachmina et al., 2009). This discrimination issue is often due to collateral required by the banking sector that women cannot fulfil since land assets generally belong to men as the head of the family. Thus, the assets are on behalf of the husbands/men. This issue is part of a major constraint that indigenous Papuan women traders encounter to be involved in developing their trade activities and involved as direct beneficiaries of economic growth in the Skouw-Wutung Border.

Without knowledge, skills and capital, indigenous Papuan women will continue to maintain their subsistence economy which is very vulnerable to capital flow cooptation represented by migrant traders. For Papuan women traders, any attempt to gain access to capital, however, is not an easy matter. The prevailing conventional banking system requires

access to capital in line with ownership of assets and networks as collateral. In the context of Papuan society, women do not have the access, let alone control over assets such as land, houses or other fixed assets. Asset is owned by men or custom (customary system). Therefore, any conventional financial service provider that requires assets as collateral has become the inaccessible institutions for Papuan women traders. Moreover, the obligatory formal written procedure consisting of the registration process, reporting trading activities is another barrier or issue for them who are mostly still illiterate.

The above-mentioned objective reality illustrates their economic and social conditions in sharp contrast to the conditions of migrant traders and places them in a vulnerable and marginal position.

Marginalization is an important concept in this study for understanding the relationship between regional economic growth due to interstate industrialization and trades, and the women's duties and positions, particularly those of Papuan women traders. Like conveyed in a conceptual framework, marginalization is simply defined as exclusion. We can understand this process as the change of power relations among people in such a way that made a community group cut off from access and vital resources (land and water, capital, employment, education, political rights, etc.), which gradually monopolized by a small elite group in a society. As a consequence, women - in this case, women Papuan traders - must rely on their marginal sources of the peripheral market economy. Marginalization is not only a matter of loss of relative access to economic resources. Marginalization can also include loss of status, self-esteem and self-confidence as an integral aspect of the lives of marginal people (Grijns, 1992)

Scott further explained that there are 4 (four) dimensions of marginalization of women, namely: 1) marginalization as exclusion from productive employment, 2) marginalization as a concentration on the margins of the labour market, 3) marginalization as the feminization of the productive sectors or as segregation of certain activities by sex, and 4) marginalization as widening economic inequality between one group and another. This can be inequality of wages/payment, access to benefits and facilities, etc. (Grijns, 1992, Saptari: 2016). Based on the results of the study, the four dimensions of marginalization of Papuan women traders differ from each other according to their intensity.

This study also shows that, in fact, regarding marginalization, we cannot clearly separate one dimension from another. A dimension of marginalization - where one group is marginalized - will give rise to another dimension.

Without a positive discrimination policy, affirmative action and social inclusion policy, indigenous Papuan women traders will have no capacity to actively participate in the development process and economic growth of the region and community. These conditions eventually will not position them as direct beneficiaries of the achievement of development and economic growth of the region.

Skouw-Wutung Border Trade and the Indigenous Papuans Involvement

The border outlets and infrastructure development that has supported the flow of distribution to border regions, such as bridges, roads and the outlets themselves, have had a positive impact on trades in the border region Skouw-Wutung in the past five years.

This trading activity with PNG residents is no longer held around the Skouw-Wutung Border only but has expanded to urban centres in Jayapura by sea and land. In other words, the existing infrastructure development has indeed encouraged the dynamics and economic growth of the local community in a positive manner.

Border trades in the Skouw-Wutung region have been developing since 2002 at the time the temporary markets (*pasar kaget*) were held at the border. With their trading expertise, the migrant traders from Bugis-Makassar have dominated the region. They carry daily basic needs such as rice, packaged food, electronic devices, and building materials. As an attempt to put the border trade activities in order, in 2004, the Provincial Government of Papua in collaboration with the Chamber of Commerce and Industry of Papua established a trade centre. Following that collaboration, the two border temporary markets: Kadin Market and Lochin Market, were open under the title "Christmas Border" which accommodated approximately 106 active traders.

Further developments in border trade have occurred since the meeting between the former president Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono and PNG prime minister in 2010. It has also dealt with ministerial-level agreements regarding collaboration activities for the *Defense Cooperation Agreement*, *Double Taxation Agreement* and *Letters of Exchange on Agriculture*. The meeting between the two-state

leaders also agreed on the measures to formally open the border region for people-to-people relations. The President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono signed the inscription at the RI-PNG border post as a concrete measure of the agreement which has been delayed for two years.

Indonesia's Ministry of Trade then took measures to develop a pilot market at the border (border outlets) as a concrete measure in realizing cooperation between the two countries. On June 27, 2011, Minister of Commerce Marie Pangestu said to the reporters that the government had set an agenda to improve trades in the border regions. The government would also focus on developing the Skouw-Wutu border region as the initial priority of the reform agenda for border trade. Based on this measure, the government is expected to get a pilot model later applied for border outlet development in the other nine (9) border regions, including Entikong in West Kalimantan (Tempo Interaktif, June 27, 2011).

There are several reasons why the Ministry of Trade prioritizes the Skouw-Wutung area. First, the strategic location makes the region an important entry point for the Indonesia's export growth to the PNG regions. Secondly, the border trade activities which took place at the Lo-Chin traditional market and Marketing Point (developed by the Provincial Government of Papua) have provided a large income for Indonesia with a transaction value of US \$ 202,430 .- in 2010 (*Minister of Trade's Visit at Skouw Market at Jayapura: Increasing Exports Through the Border Market*, 2011). There were significant potentials for an additional and growth of income in the following years.

Building a border outlet is one of the government's efforts to encourage the indigenous Papuans involvement in economic activities of the region. The government then established a positive discrimination policy by allocating the number of stalls to migrant traders and indigenous traders, respectively 50% of the total 200 stalls. Stalls distribution has involved indigenous Papuans in trade activities. Through the Ministry of Trade, the government then set an empowerment agenda that provided indigenous Papuans with technical knowledge about any details on trades, including on setting goods prices, quality, distribution systems, and marketing management.

The government has tried to develop an inclusive trade program for indigenous Papuans, including women Papuan traders. It was expected that indigenous Papuans could become direct beneficiaries of the border trade development program.

However, the results of the field study show that after the market has been running for approximately 2 (two) years, the research team found that almost none of indigenous Papuans, including the women ones, survived to trade in the market. At the time of this study conducted, most of the non-Papuan (migrant) traders had occupied almost all of the stalls in the pilot market. Transfer of stalls ownership has taken place through the under-hand leasing and purchase and selling system. This practice has slowly shifted out indigenous Papuans and they are no longer an important part of the border market development.

Papuan women traders tried to survive by only occupying small stalls around the market or rolling out tarps on the market sidewalks. Their stalls are made simply, not permanent, and physically concentrated in the front yard of the market - which should be used for parking lots.

This fact shows the process and dynamics of competition between migrant and indigenous Papuans traders in which women Papuan traders must 'lose competition' with non-Papuan traders for various reasons: experience, networks, expertise and capital. As said a "mama" (used when addressing a married woman) "*we have few goods and it's different from their goods - new traders - Buyers prefer to buy from them because their goods are varied and also better*", this competitive condition eventually made them decide to rent out their stalls to migrant traders, particularly non-Papuan traders. Nearly 100% of Papuan women traders do this. On the other hand, this has become an opportunity for migrant traders to expand their trade by increasing capital and supply networks of goods, both from Java and the Jakarta Region.

The cultural difference between indigenous Papuans and migrant traders is one of the factors for the economic backwardness of the Papuan women traders. This shows the real situation of how the element of ethnicity related to the accumulation of knowledge and skills, has influenced economic opportunities (Collier, 2000; Stewart & Hyclak, 1979).

The migrants, mostly are Bugis, Makassarese and Javanese, have had culture and trading experience passed down from their ancestors. While indigenous Papuan has a culture as gatherers. These cultural and experience differences have created a great inequality among the competing knowledge, skill, network and mentality. This issue led the research team to a deeper examination on the existence of indigenous Papuans and their economic activities in the Muara Tami region with the aim of understanding the reasons for the underdevelopment or the marginalization tendency of indigenous Papuans in trades, particularly of their female counterparts in the region (Court, 2012; Elmelech & Lu, 2004; Higginbotham & Romero, 1997).

Critical Notes on the Indigenous Papuans Empowerment through the Border Outlet Development Program

The border outlet development program as described in the previous section illustrates the initiatives of the central and regional governments to promote the progress of the border region which involves the structures, infrastructure and the border market developments. This government program has proven to have made a real contribution to physical development and economic growth in the region. The problem is that regional development and economic growth have not been evenly distributed to indigenous Papuans, particularly to their women traders.

The government seeks to provide a positive discrimination policy by providing them with stalls in the Skouw-Wutung Border market, but in fact, it does not necessarily encourage indigenous Papuans to be involved, actively participate and benefit directly from social and economic progress in the region. Moreover, the empowerment agenda to support a positive discrimination policy for indigenous Papuans remains limited and not comprehensive. Providing access to kiosks for women Papuan traders should ideally be equipped with the delivery of knowledge on agricultural production and post-harvest. Papua with its gatherer culture requires knowledge, skills and assistance in both the production and post-production processes. Without it, it is difficult for their products to compete with the migrant traders-generated products. Having marketing skills is also essential. Consumers in border markets come from various segments of society and different ethnic and linguistic backgrounds.

It is necessary to equip the marketing technical skills provided by the Ministry of Trade and other Ministries with other technical capabilities such as packaging, processed products diversification, communication skills, network building among Papuan and migrant women traders, and network building for a wider goods distribution both inside and outside of Papua.

Border trade issues are quite complex so that a long-term development agenda is required, specifically on the border regions. In fact, it is more complex than the mapping of problems formulated by the central government. That's why policies and programs formulated by policymakers from the central level have not hit the mark. It is impossible to understand the whole issue of women Papuan traders only based on their trade issues, but it is further related to the cultural issue- the construction of gender division of labour - and the women needs at work--, women's access and control to resources, including important access to economic resources and land. Another important issue is that support for women's empowerment is necessary to ensure that policies will take a side on women's issues and positions based on its social context.

The central government in cooperation with the local government has stepped up with several programs to encourage the indigenous Papuans involvement, particularly their women traders. The government has awareness as well as a political will to ensure all parties are involved in the development and growth of border trade. But the efforts are still not optimal. Several other strategic measures are needed to complete and finalize the existing programs and measures, including:

Firstly, the policy agenda aimed at improving the welfare of indigenous Papuans must depart from a comprehensive and sustainable work agenda with an ability to assist women gradually until they can actively participate in modern economic activities. In brief, the empowerment agenda must also be able to get women involved in the most basic stages to the advanced ones in productive economic activities that appropriate to their environmental conditions and cultural systems.

Secondly, government programs for women must be given based on the their socio-cultural context. When the government provides stalls for women Papuan traders, the government must prepare other supporting programs such as transportation that ensure the

accessible markets for Papuan women traders, the continuity of their trade commodities, the government's monitoring to ensure that kiosks are not sold by any party including men or husbands. Papuan women do not have access to assets including land and property. So, when women are given access, it is necessary to ensure that the access is not revoked from them and their use is in accordance with their initial designation.

Thirdly, capital is a constraint for Papuan women traders. Therefore, it is also important to open access to capital. But considering that currently, most Papuan women traders are illiterate, access to banking is not the right choice. Access to capital groups, cooperatives and the like can be an opportunity that is worth a try.

Fourthly, opening up access for women Papuan traders to land and other economic resources are essential. The Agrarian Reform policy agenda set by the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs/National Land Office can serve as an important instrument to initiate asset strengthening and support access to capital that may be carried out through this work scheme. Building the strength of community assets (especially for indigenous Papuans) through agrarian reform activities is one of the important factors serving as a starting point for the development of their economic strength. Speaking of the encouraging agrarian policy, a specific study is needed regarding women's access to and control over land, particularly regarding the ownership, inheritance, management and use of the proceeds. On the other hand, the ability to make banks understand the situation and condition of Papuan women is also substantial in formulating relevant loan or capital assistance schemes. It should be a supportive scheme, instead of a burdensome with various requirements.

Thus, the combination of a sustainable empowerment work agenda through a series of mentoring activities of indigenous Papuans serving as economic actors and an asset strengthening agenda through land distribution and asset legalization can be a new breakthrough that would overcome the impasse of social, economic, and political inequalities towards underdevelopment issues in the Papua region.

The problem now no longer relies on the modern infrastructure and facilities

development only, but on how social and cultural transformation related to economic progress is able to invite the participation of local communities, provide direct benefits, open access as well as control over development results and their long-term use.

In carrying out the empowerment agenda for indigenous Papuans, especially their women traders, there are two important things that should be noted. Firstly, the inequal development process in the region has made indigenous Papuans lag behind migrants who benefit from economic development in Muara Tam. This is directly related to the social and cultural system of indigenous Papuans. Most of them still do subsistence economy activities that meet the consumption needs from their fields, livestock raising and fishing on the beach. They went to the traditional markets only when there is an excess of the garden products they usually consume, for example, they sell tubers, catch fish and game.

Secondly, another problem related to the geographical gap. The indigenous Papuan settlement area is located generally far from the crowd and the circulation centre of daily basic commodities imported from out of the region such as rice, cooking oil, milk, etc, including packaged food/beverage. As a consequence, they have to spend additional costs for transportation to be able to access their basic needs. That's why the consumer goods eventually become more expensive than those in the West Koya and East Koya settlements. This condition is a separate dimension of marginalization. In other words, there must be a regulatory policy that takes into account the economic accessibility of indigenous Papuans to the centres of productive economic activities; including the calculation of distance between settlements and markets, the access to mobility by the availability of an easy, inexpensive and accessible transportation during the productive times.

It is important for the government to take into account these two issues seriously in promoting the border region development in the Muara Tami District. Disregarding the issues will encourage the marginalization of indigenous Papuans, including their women traders. This condition will also deepen the inequality and at the same time social jealousy which potentially creates tension or conflict among ethnic groups and strengthens the political issue of Papua's independence.

Speaking of positive developments, since the onset of Papua Special Autonomy policy, the local government has done any attempt to support a positive discrimination policy for encouraging and ensuring the participation and benefits for the Papuan people within the regional development. Government agencies have developed empowerment schemes that encourage Papuans to progress.

However, the results of this study indicate many limitations in the existing empowerment schemes. One example is the empowerment scheme for Papuans, particularly the Papuan women traders, for developing the Skouw-Wutung pilot market at the border. The local Trade Office has implemented a positive discrimination policy by providing stalls and a series of basic training agendas on retail trade, but in fact, it has not been able to encourage indigenous Papuans, particularly their women traders to participate and become direct beneficiaries of the dynamics of the local economy. They have resold or leased their stalls to migrant traders who have better trading experience and skills than them.

Based on the field research, strengthening and sustainable empowerment schemes are needed. The scheme should not be partial by providing economic facilities such as kiosks, booths, and skills training only, but also be accompanied by intensive assistance to involve indigenous Papuans in the economic activities of border trades. Policies should rely on the study of culture, especially on women's access and control of the land. In brief, the empowerment model must integrate skills and knowledge development and long-term assistance that helps Papuan women traders to have strategic assets and access including the access to land and capital funding based on the needs and economic development capacity of the majority of indigenous Papuans.

CONCLUSION

The border trade development program has progressed both physically and economically. However, the border trade development and growth has not provided the same benefits for indigenous Papuans, including Papuan women traders, and the migrant traders. Women have not been able to keep up with the rhythm of contemporary trade activities, given women are likely to carry out subsistence economic activities, that is doing economic activities to fulfil their daily needs without being oriented to seeking or

collecting/accumulating profits.

The highly competitive border trade situation with the presence of migrant traders as the economic actors has placed Papuan women traders into the dimensions of marginalization. According to their social context, Papuan women traders experience all four (4) dimensions of marginalization that Scott put forward. Since one dimension of marginalization influences the other ones, the economic subsistence and the dimension of marginalization put the Papuan women traders at a very vulnerable position.

In this case, a positive discrimination policy, affirmative action, an integrated and comprehensive social inclusion policy are needed so that Papuan women traders can take their position and become direct beneficiaries of the development and economic growth of the border trade. Without this policy, in the future, this condition will make indigenous Papuan women traders lag behind all the dynamics of development achievement and economic achievement in the region.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah, I., & Abdullah, I. (2012). Penelitian Berwawasan Gender dalam Ilmu Sosial. *Humaniora*, 15(3), 265-275. doi:10.22146/jh.v15i3.794
- Anderson R Benedict, The Journal of Asian Studies / Volume 37 / Issue 01 / The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia. By James C. Scott. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976. ix, 246 pp November 1977, pp 172 - 174 DOI: 10.2307/2053400, Published online: 23 March 2011
- Awang, A. H., Sulehan, J., Abu Bakar, N. R., Abdullah, M. Y., & Liu, O. P. (2013). Informal cross-border trade Sarawak (Malaysia)-Kalimantan (Indonesia): A catalyst for border community's development. *Asian Social Science*, 9(4), 167-173. doi:10.5539/ass.v9n4p167
- Collier, P. (2000). Ethnicity, politics and economic performance. *Economics and Politics*, 12(3), 225-245. doi:10.1111/1468-0343.00076
- Court, K. L. (2012). Mapping the Economic Contribution of Women Entrepreneurs. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 3(1), 136-145.
- Daturatte, S. R., Jinca, M. Y., & Wunas, S. (2010). Sistem Jaringan Transportasi Logistik Kawasan Perbatasan Provinsi Papua Dengan dengan Papua New Guinea. *Jurnal Transportasi*, 10(3), 193-204.
- Elmelech, Y., & Lu, H. H. (2004). Race, ethnicity, and the gender poverty gap. *Social Science Research*, 33(1), 158-182. doi:10.1016/S0049-089X(03)00044-9
- Grijns, M. (Ed.). (1992). *Gender, marginalisasi dan industri pedesaan: pengusaha, pekerja upahan dan pekerja keluarga wanita di Jawa Barat*. Bandung: Akatiga.
- Higginbotham, E., & Romero, M. (1997). *Women and work : exploring race, ethnicity, and class*. *Women and work*. doi:10.2307/2654103
- Kunjungan Mendag Ke Pasar Skouw di Jayapura: Meningkatkan Ekspor Melalui Pasar Perbatasan. (2011). Jakarta.
- Leadem, D. F. A. (2013). An Approach Toward Sustainability On Cross Border Regions. *Revisra Geografica de America Central*, (50), 141-164.
- Maleong, L. J. (2007). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Meagher, K. (2013). *Unlocking the Informal Economy: A Literature Review on Linkages Between Formal and Informal Economies in Developing Countries*. *Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing*. doi:10.1007/978-1-4615-0575-4_12
- Perpustakaan UGM, i-lib. (2003). Pola Ketahanan Dan Strategi Rumah Tangga Di Desa Pertanian Subsisten (Studi kasus Desa Tirtohargo Kecamatan Kretek Kabupaten Bantul). *Jurnal I-Lib UGM*. Retrieved from <http://i-lib.ugm.ac.id/jurnal/download.php?dataId=2196>
- Rachmina, D., Gender, F. K., & Kredit, D. (2009). FENOMENA KESETARAAN GENDER DALAM KREDIT. *Jurnal Agribisnis Dan Ekonomi Pertanian*, 3(1).
- Scott, J. C. (1983). *Moral Ekonomi Petani: Pergolakan dan Subsistensi di Asia Tenggara*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Statistik, B. P. (2018). *Jayapura dalam Angka, 2017*. BPS Kota Jayapura.
- Stewart, J. B., & Hyclak, T. (1979). Ethnicity and Economic Opportunity. *American Journal of Economics and Sociology*, 38(3), 319-335. doi:10.1111/j.1536-7150.1979.tb02836.x
- Timisela, S. G. (2015). Dampak Perdagangan Lintas Batas Terhadap Perekonomian Masyarakat Lokal (Studi Kasus: Wilayah Perbatasan RI-PNG di Distrik Muara Tami). *JESP*, 7(2), 35-50.
- Triyono, & Wijayanti, S. (2017). Pola Kegiatan Perempuan Pedagang Sayur di Pasar Gabus Jatnom Kabupaten Klaten. *Magistra*, 29(101), 43-56.
- Wellalage, N., & Locke, S. (2017). Access to credit by SMEs in South Asia: do women entrepreneurs face discrimination. *Research in International Business and Finance*, 41, 336-346. doi:10.1016/j.ribaf.2017.04.053